Hands-on-Training: Screen shots of the asthma care return on investment calculator

Ginger Smith Carls, M.A., Rosanna M. Coffey, Ph.D., Ronald J. Ozminkowski, Ph.D., Karen Ho, M.S., Mika Nagamine, Ph.D., Katheryn Ryan

December 6-7, 2007
State Healthcare Quality Improvement Workshop:
Tools You Can Use to Make a Difference
Steps in the ROI calculator

1. Describe population
2. Estimate number of participants
3. Estimate baseline utilization or missed work days
4. Estimate impact of the asthma program
5. Estimate program cost

ROI

Meta-analysis

Default or user data

User choices about asthma program
1. Demographics of populations
   - Medicaid (CMS 2003)
   - Employer sponsored health insurance (CPS 2003-2005)
     - State employees (Employees from BLS 2003-2005)

2. Large, nationwide, medical claims database (MarketScan™)
   - Prevalence rates
   - Utilization and costs for asthma patients

3. Literature review
   - Impact of asthma care programs
   - Cost to implement asthma care programs
Example

- Based on default values of the calculator when calculator is opened
- Asthma care program for children and adults with persistent asthma for Medicaid programs (nationwide)
Population

Select the type and geography of the general population (people with and without asthma) that you are considering for asthma care quality improvement. For a general discussion of this page, click on the black question mark. For information on a particular item, select a blue question mark.

Population type: Medicaid
Geographic location: Nation

Size of population: 47,070,208

Age & gender of population:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 - 4</td>
<td>6.2%</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 17</td>
<td>15.0%</td>
<td>21.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 - 34</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
<td>13.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 - 44</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 - 54</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55 - 64</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sum should be 100%.

Race of population:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>43.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American</td>
<td>23.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>22.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian or Pacific Islander</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian / Alaskan Native</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other / Unknown</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sum should be 100%.

Data sources?
Participants

For a general discussion of this page, click on the black question mark.

Do the following on this page:

1) Select the age group and asthma severity that you want to target for a quality improvement program. (If you want to target people through emergency departments or hospital inpatient settings, select "persistent asthma with an acute visit").

2) Review the number of people eligible for program and the percent expected to participate in the program. Modify if needed.

Age Group:
Select children, adults, or both.

Asthma Severity/Definition:
- All asthma (intermittent & persistent asthma)
- Persistent asthma only
- Persistent asthma with an acute visit

Number of patients eligible for the program, by age & gender:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 - 4</td>
<td>136,966</td>
<td>126,661</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 17</td>
<td>285,481</td>
<td>300,304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 - 34</td>
<td>101,469</td>
<td>172,338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 - 44</td>
<td>61,146</td>
<td>190,717</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 - 54</td>
<td>100,414</td>
<td>270,990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65 - 64</td>
<td>79,246</td>
<td>149,804</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Asthma patients eligible for program: 1,996,456

(Calculated from population, age group, asthma severity/definition, and prevalence rates.)

Percent of eligibles who will participate: 25.0%

Expected patients who will participate: 499,114

View asthma prevalence rates*
Asthma definitions

- **All Asthma**
  - patient has at least one claim with asthma as a primary or secondary diagnosis during the year (ICD-9-CM code 493.xx)

- **Persistent asthma**
  - One or more of the following is true using one year of data:
    a) ED visit or inpatient admission with asthma diagnosis
    b) 4 outpatient visits and at least 2 asthma medication fills
    c) 4 asthma medication fills, if all 4 fills for leukotrienes, then must have at least 1 claim with an asthma diagnosis

- **Persistent asthma with acute visit**
  - Met criteria a) for persistent asthma

*Similar to HEDIS definition, differs in that only 1 year of data is used.*

Asthma medications include: Antiasthmatic combinations, Bronchodilator combinations, Inhaled anticholinergics, Inhaled corticosteroids, Leukotriene modifiers, Long acting adrenergic bronchodilators, Mast cell stabilizers, Methylxanthines, Short acting adrenergic bronchodilators, Corticosteroid tablets or syrup (oral corticosteroid)
Baseline Data

For a general discussion of this page, click on the black question mark.

Make two decisions on this page:
1) Select a treatment definition and cost perspective for calculating results.
2) Review the baseline utilization and cost estimates. Modify them if you have pre-program estimates for your population.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment Definition</th>
<th>Cost Perspective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asthma Treatment</td>
<td>Program / plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any Treatment</td>
<td>Pgrm / plan &amp; per patient</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Annual emergency department visits per patient | 0.24 | Cost of an emergency department visit | $86 |
| Annual hospital stays per patient             | 0.06 | Cost of a hospital stay               | $6,431 |
| Annual outpatient visits per patient         | 1.16 | Cost of an outpatient visit           | $38  |
| Annual cost of asthma medications per patient| $735 | Annual cost of asthma-related ancillary services per patient | $35  |
| Annual missed work days per adult from asthma | 5.82 | Cost of a missed work day            | $64.36 |
| Annual missed school days per child from asthma | 4.84 | Cost of a missed school day          | $35.00 |
**Program Impact**

This page shows the impact estimates from a meta-analysis of the research literature on asthma quality improvement and disease management. You have one decision to make and one option on this page.

1) Select the type of study you want to use for results.
2) Freeze the impact values if you want to compare different scenarios when the impact stays the same.

Select a study design: **Randomized controlled studies**

Check to keep impact at current values: **Freeze impact values**

### Healthcare Measures:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program impact</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>on emergency department visits</td>
<td>-25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on hospital stays</td>
<td>-37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on outpatient visits</td>
<td>-21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on the cost of ancillary services</td>
<td>-66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on the cost of asthma medications</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Productivity Measures:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program impact</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>on missed work days per adult</td>
<td>-66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on missed school days per child</td>
<td>-57%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Negative percents are a decrease and positive percents are an increase in health care use or cost or missed days.
Program Cost

For a general discussion of this page, click on the black question mark.

Review four decisions that will affect calculations of the cost of the program to be implemented. Modify if appropriate.

1) Length of operation planned for the program.
2) Time until the full-impact of program is expected.
3) Cost of the program per person per year (consider changing based on costs estimates for specific programs from vendors).
4) Discount rate for valuing savings and costs that occur in different years.
   (If immediacy of results is essential in your program, you may want to raise the discount rate.)

How long will the program operate (1 to 10 years)? 5
What is the annual program cost per participant? $395

How many years until the program achieves full impact? 2
What is the discount rate for ROI calculation? 3%
Results

For a general discussion of this page, click on the black question mark.

This page shows the impact of the asthma program and summarizes the assumptions you made in the calculator. Make two decisions on this page: 1) Whether to include health care savings, productivity gains, or both. 2) Whether to report results per participant or per program.

Choose whether to display averages or totals: Show averages per participant, Show totals for all participants

### Health Care Savings per Participant

- Emergency department visits: $257, 8.2%
- Hospital confinements: 227.8%
- Outpatient visits: 8.1%
- Asthma-specific ancillary services: 14.9%
- Asthma medications: -187.6%

Total: 100.0%

### Productivity Gain per Participant

- Productivity for adults: $1,714, 76.9%
- Productivity for children: 23.1%

Total: 100.0%

### Total Program Cost per Participant

- Over Years the Program Operates: $1,809

Choose health care savings, productivity gains, or both:
- Include Health Care savings in the NPV and ROI
- Include Productivity gain in the NPV and ROI

### Current Model Settings

- Population type: Medicaid
- Geographic location: Nation
- Asthma definition: Persistent only
- Adults and/or children: Adults and Children
- Estimated persons with asthma: 1,996,456
- Percent who will participate: 25%
- Estimated program participants: 499,114
- Annual program cost per participant: $395
- Years the program operates: 5
- Program phase-in period (years): 2
- Discount rate for NPV and ROI: 3%

### Overall Impact of Program

- Net Present Value (NPV): -$1,562
- Return On Investment (ROI): 0.14
- Break-Even Program Impact: -13%
- Break-Even Program Cost: $56.04
Undiscounted Results per Person for the User-Specified Program Tabulated by Outcome Measure and Year

The earliest year represents the baseline period before the program is implemented. Savings are estimated by comparing the results on this page to a scenario with no program, for which the baseline values hold steady over time.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annual utilization &amp; cost per patient</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emergency department visits</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital confinements</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outpatient visits</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency department cost</td>
<td>$20.64</td>
<td>$18.06</td>
<td>$15.48</td>
<td>$15.48</td>
<td>$15.48</td>
<td>$15.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital confinement cost</td>
<td>$366</td>
<td>$314</td>
<td>$243</td>
<td>$243</td>
<td>$243</td>
<td>$243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outpatient cost</td>
<td>$44.08</td>
<td>$39.45</td>
<td>$34.82</td>
<td>$34.82</td>
<td>$34.82</td>
<td>$34.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asthma-specific ancillary cost</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
<td>$23.45</td>
<td>$11.90</td>
<td>$11.90</td>
<td>$11.90</td>
<td>$11.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asthma medication cost</td>
<td>$735.00</td>
<td>$793.80</td>
<td>$852.60</td>
<td>$852.60</td>
<td>$852.60</td>
<td>$852.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missed work days for adults</td>
<td>5.82</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missed school days for children</td>
<td>4.84</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>2.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Productivity cost for adults</td>
<td>$374.56</td>
<td>$213.51</td>
<td>$52.44</td>
<td>$52.44</td>
<td>$52.44</td>
<td>$52.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Productivity cost for caregivers</td>
<td>$169.40</td>
<td>$121.12</td>
<td>$72.84</td>
<td>$72.84</td>
<td>$72.84</td>
<td>$72.84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Literature review methods

- Inclusion criteria
- Characteristics of included studies
- Calculation of outcome (impact of the program)
- Analysis
Study Inclusion criteria

- Studies searched (76 studies met criteria):
  - Asthma care quality improvement: Physician & patient training—written asthma action plan, etc. (not drug efficacy)
  - U.S. studies: 1995 thru 2006
  - Populations: Children and adults under 65
  - Studies: Individual interventions (not meta-analyses or editorials)
  - Impact period: 6+ months
  - Impact: Use or cost of medical care services and productivity (not asthma knowledge or quality of life)
  - Insurance: All types
Abstracting literature

Details recorded

- Characteristics of studies and patients (e.g., asthma severity)
- Baseline utilization and cost by patients in the studies
- Impact of program on percent change in visits or days (for default values)
Included studies

- The 52 studies report 261 pieces of information
  - Related to service utilization and productivity
  - For children, adults or both
  - With multiple items (e.g., on ED visits, if the study reported results separately for children and adults)

- Outcomes (number of related study results)
  - Emergency department visits (90)
  - Hospital stays (75)
  - Outpatient visits (57)
  - Medication costs (12)
  - Cost of ancillary services (3)
  - Missed work or school days due to asthma (24)
Study characteristics

- Useable means study had to report average visit rates, missed days, or cost (not just percent with event)

- **Most useable studies:**
  - Had a control group (56%); many had randomized controls (38%)
  - Involved patient self-management (85%) and regular medical management (58%); many had a written asthma action plan (40%)
  - Focused on children only (46%)
  - Focused on populations with persistent asthma (55%)
    - Persistent asthma = subjects met HEDIS criteria OR had 2 or more hospital or ED visits at baseline
  - Had mixed insurance coverage (79%)
## Included studies and patients*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cost Components</th>
<th>Children only</th>
<th>Adults Only</th>
<th>Both</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Patients</td>
<td>Studies</td>
<td>Patients</td>
<td>Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ED visits</strong></td>
<td>13,213</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>714</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hospitalizations</strong></td>
<td>17,575</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>7,161</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outpatient visits</strong></td>
<td>20,229</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6,986</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Missed work/school days</strong></td>
<td>4,172</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>521</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Medication Cost</strong></td>
<td>486</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ancillary service cost</strong></td>
<td>61</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total direct cost</strong></td>
<td>2,729</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>649</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total indirect cost</strong></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Includes patients in treatment and control groups
Study designs

- **Randomized controlled trial (RCT) studies**
  - Standard for clinical efficacy
  - More likely to be accepted by clinicians—main target of QI programs

- **Statistically controlled studies**
  - Much larger samples with greater precision
  - Can control for more patient and setting attributes than RCTs

- **Studies without a control group**
  - Included for showing importance of the study design in measuring outcomes accurately
  - For a preliminary benchmark that can guide a program in its early days about its success or failure

**NOTE: Results are available for each design type**
Program impact calculations

- All studies
  - Pre-post treatment comparison
- Controlled
  - Post treatment-to-control comparison
  - Net change pre-post, treatment-to-control comparison

**Example calculation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data</th>
<th>ED visits per person per year</th>
<th>Before intervention</th>
<th>After intervention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Treatment Group</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Calculations**

- Pre-post treatment: (2-4) / 4*100 = -50%
- Post treatment-to-control: (2-3) / 3*100 = -33%
- Net change: [(2-4) / 4*100] - [(3-4) / 4*100] = -50% - (-25%) = -25%
Analysis of results

- **Regressions**: study-result outcomes regressed on study population and design features
  - **Ys**: ED visits, hospitalizations, outpatient visits, missed work/school days, and medication costs
  - **Xs**: Study population, study design, sample size, length of study, and contact with the physician or patient
  - **Bs**: Average impact of each study feature on Ys, controlling for other Xs

- **Other issues**:
  - Standard errors adjusted for multiple results per study
  - Studies weighted equally, by using inverse of number of results per study as weight on each study-result observation
  - Ancillary services not analyzed in regression context, due to the small number of studies
Selected literature reviews


